

Sample Grading Rubrics



Mapping the Argument Accurately

Does the map...	Yes (1)	No (0)
accurately identify the main claim of the argument?		
accurately capture the reasoning in the argument? (i.e., so that the author of the argument would agree that their reasoning is represented)		
map types of premises (including independent, sub- and co-premises) correctly?		
place all premises in the map so that every premise follows the Reason Rule (i.e., provides a reason to believe the claim above)?		
TOTAL (1 pt for each Yes)	__/4	

Overall, how well does the map reflect the structure of the original argument?

4 – The argument map correctly and completely illustrates the structure of the entire original argument

3 – The argument map correctly illustrates the structure of the argument, although the map is incomplete (missing or mis-stating 1-2 key premises)

2 – The argument map does not illustrate the original argument due to a significant number of missing or mis-stated premises

1 – The argument map does not illustrate either the structure or content of the original argument

TOTAL: __/4

Evaluating the Argument

Did the evaluation...	Yes (1)	No (0)
clearly follow a two-step process of evaluating premises, then evaluating support relationships?		
evaluate premises based on truth or plausibility?		
evaluate support relationships based on strength and weakness?		
TOTAL (1 pt for each Yes)	__/3	

Overall, how well does the analysis evaluate the argument?

3 – The analysis correctly analyzes the strength and weakness of support relationships and truth/plausibility of premises throughout the argument

2 – The analysis correctly analyzes the strength and weakness of support relationships and truth/plausibility of premises, although the analysis is incomplete (missing 1-2 key support relationships or premises)

1 – The analysis misses more than two key support relationships or premises, or the analysis varies considerably from the provided explanation in ways that reflect limited understanding of how to evaluate arguments

TOTAL: ___/3

TOTAL SCORE: ____/14

Your argument map could be improved by doing the following:

Your evaluation of the argument map could be improved by doing the following:

Additional comments: